

Towards a New Ethics of Audio Description: Re-creation as a Procedure / *Por uma nova ética audiodescritiva: a recriação como procedimento*

Marcelo Santos*

ABSTRACT

Audio description (AD) is the act of providing blind and low vision people with a sound translation of visual and audiovisual communication programs, such as TV shows, artworks, or operas. This activity was formalized in the 1980s in the United States, using the model: “describe what you see.” In this model, the audio describer, wielding the controversial banner of “objectivity,” offers a supposedly impartial - and to some extent protocolized - reading of what he/she observes. The American school prospered and spread around the world, becoming the standard for AD, even in Brazil. However, by recovering the best Tupinikin tradition of “trans-creation” or “re-creation,” defended by the concrete poets, we raise, at least for the visual arts, another methodological/experimental proposal: using sound poetry diagrams to perform AD, a process known as intersemiotic translation. It is widely believed that the sensitive layer, which is significant in the arts, is often lost in the technicality of standardized AD, and that diagrammatic constructions, can perhaps recover this dimension through sound signs that are intelligible but, above all, sensual. There is, as we explain, a certain aesthetic, ethical, and semiotic articulation that reinforces the proposal presented here.

KEYWORDS: Audio Description; Translation Ethics; Sound Diagrams; Poetics

RESUMO

A audiodescrição (AD) consiste em fornecer a pessoas com cegueira e baixa visão a tradução sonora de processos comunicativos visuais e audiovisuais, como programas de TV, obras de artes plásticas ou ópera. Esta atividade se formalizou na década de 1980, nos Estados Unidos, a partir do modelo “descreva o que você vê”. Tal proposição, o audiodescritor, empunhando a controversa bandeira da “objetividade”, oferece leitura supostamente isenta - e em certa medida protocolar - sobre aquilo que observa. A escola americana prosperou e se disseminou pelo mundo, tornando-se o padrão da AD realizada, inclusive, no Brasil. Recuperando, contudo, a melhor tradição tupiniquim da “transcrição” ou “recriação”, defendida pelos poetas concretos, lançaremos, ao menos para as artes visuais, outra proposta metodológica/experimental: o uso de diagramas poéticos sonoros para a realização da AD, compreendida como tradução intersemiótica. Acredita-se que a camada sensível, tão cara às artes, é muitas vezes perdida no tecnicismo da AD normatizada, e que construções diagramáticas talvez possam recuperar esta dimensão através de signos sonoros inteligíveis mas, sobretudo, sensuais. Há, conforme explicamos, certa articulação estética, ética e semiótica que referenda a proposta aqui apresentada.

PALAVRAS-CHAVE: Audiodescrição; Ética tradutória; Diagramas sonoros; Poética

* Faculdade Cásper Líbero - FACASPER, São Paulo, SP, Brazil; CNPq, Brasília, Brazil; masmoraes@casperlibero.edu.br

*It is sad to explain a poem. It is useless, too.
A poem is not explainable. It is like a punch.*
Hilda Hilst

The revolutionary and philosopher Leon Trotsky wrote in the essay *The Formalist School of Poetry and Marxism* that “it is useful, and quite necessary for a poet to estimate a word not only in accord with its inner meaning, but also in accord with its acoustics” (2005, p.139).¹ The premise, an additive suggestion, or union of the name with that which eludes it, finds resonance on page 202 of *Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics* (1984).² Thus, for the study of poetry, Mikhail Bakhtin suggests trans-linguistics, an activity concerned with the life of the word beyond its terminological condition. It is precisely in the recognition and examination of this locus, where what is said escapes the logic of speech, that the proposal of this essay largely resides: we will question the norms prescribed for the audio description (AD) of visual and audiovisual works of art, a prescription of the immaculate, to which an objective and almost mechanical audio describer aspires.

Our critique focuses on the fact that this type of audio description specifically neglects the poetic dimension, which is fundamental to experiencing the arts and, therefore, it can occasionally deviate from that which formal language communicates. An annotation by the concrete poet Décio Pignatari (2005, p.9), in his *O que é comunicação poética* [*What is Poetic Communication*], sheds more light on the subject:

Poetry seems to be more on the side of music and the fine and visual arts than that of literature. Ezra Pound thinks he does not belong to literature, and Paulo Prado goes further: he declares that literature and philosophy are poetry's two greatest enemies.³

However, following Bakhtin (*apud* TODOROV, 1997, p.6), we do not exactly support the simplistic antinomian division between poetics and other discursive modalities, particularly prose, as Paulo Prado or, for example, the formalists, wished. Rather than believing that unorthodox fabricators of language are on one side, and the rest of humanity - the vulgar voice - is on the other, we conceive a verbal acoustics that exists

¹ TROTSKY, L. *The Formalist School of Poetry and Marxism*. In: *Literature and Revolution*. Chicago: Haymarket Books, 2005.

² BAKHTIN, M. *Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1984.

³ Text in original: “A poesia parece estar mais do lado da música e das artes plásticas e visuais do que da literatura. Ezra Pound acha que ela não pertence à literatura e Paulo Prado vai mais longe: declara que a literatura e a filosofia são as duas maiores inimigas da poesia.”

between people—and it is only in this dual, bidirectional territory that sound acquires its meaning: poetic, prosaic, practical, scientific, religious... In short, the poet, when he writes, does not select an abstract system of phonetic, grammatical, and lexical possibilities – instead, he selects the social evaluations implicit in every word. For the Bakhtin Circle, when a word enters art, it is already charged with intent, opinions, and social traits, with all the marks of its territorial value system (TEZZA, 2003, p.37).⁴

Prose can lead to poetry, and the latter is often contaminated by the former (BRAIT, 2010). If our intention, therefore, is not to divide the inseparable, we aim, this must be clarified, to distinguish what belongs to the poetic instance, and this leads us back to Pignatari: When the concretist argues that poetry, perhaps, is closer to the visual arts or music than to prose, he speaks of a less narrative and more sensual verbal procedure, that is, one unattached to the narrative and committed to thrill by or in the word, and not through it. “The response to the Mallarmic riddle: the flower that is absent from all bouquets is the word flower” (PIGNATARI, 2005, p.11).⁵

In addition to pointing out the characteristics inherent to the poetic, we intend, as a necessary resolution, to discuss how this sensitive, creative and cognitive dimension of language can be incorporated into audio descriptive processes without their abdicating the desired objectivity, thus enabling the emergence of an unprecedented listening to “voices in everything and dialogic relations among them” (BAKHTIN, 1986, p.169)⁶ — the phenomenon that French philosopher and translator Jean Quillien (*apud* MESCHONNIC, 2010, p.182) calls the “indivisibility between the idea as a subjective concept and the main objective.”⁷

To build our argument, we will make particular use of the translational propositions of the concretists, and the work of the American philosopher Charles S. Peirce. In the latter case, we will employ writings on the normative sciences, in which Aesthetics is the foundation of Ethics, and this is the pillar of Logic or Language. Such

⁴ Text in original: “está entre as pessoas - e é apenas desse território duplo, bidirecional, que o som ganha o seu sentido: poético, prosaico, prático, científico, religioso... Em suma, o poeta, quando escreve, não seleciona um sistema abstrato de possibilidades fonéticas, gramaticais, lexicais – seleciona, isso sim, as avaliações sociais implícitas em cada palavra. Para o Círculo de Bakhtin, a palavra já entra na arte carregada de intenções, opiniões, traços sociais, com todas as marcas de seu território valorativo.”

⁵ Text in original: “A resposta para adivinha mallarmaica: a flor que está ausente de todos os buquês é a palavra flor.”

⁶ BAKHTIN, Mikhail. *Toward a Methodology for the Human Sciences*. In: *Speech Genres and Other Late Essays*. Austin, Texas: University of Texas Press, 1986.

⁷ Text in original: “indivisibilidade entre a ideia como conceito subjetivo e o princípio objetivo.”

an articulation, as will be seen, allows us to engineer an inseparable continuity between the subjectivity of the audio describer and the acoustic image - the poetic dimension - and the predominantly descriptive face *per se* - as objectively as possible - of the verbally translated visual or audiovisual sign.

1 Connecting Audio Description to Poetics: Some Explanatory Notes

Audio description (AD), legally defined as an accessibility resource by Decree No. 310 of the Ministry of Communications, in 2006, is conceptualized as

an assistive technology that allows the visually impaired to be included within the audience for audiovisual products. The resource consists of translating images into words. It is therefore also defined as a mode of intersemiotic audiovisual translation, in which the visual sign is transposed to the verbal sign (LIMA, 2011).⁸

According to data from the last demographic census conducted by the Instituto Brasileiro de Geografia e Estatística – IBGE [Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics], approximately 24% of Brazilians, or 45.6 million people, are disabled; 35 million say they have some kind of visual impairment. The number is significant and points to the need to develop inclusive actions to integrate blind and low vision people with the rest of society. These actions, of course, should include AD, a practice officially introduced in the United States in the 1970s, following Gregory Frazier’s thesis on the translation of television programs for blind people (SNYDER, 2005, p.191).

In the following decade, the 1980s, audio description became widespread and dozens of establishments began producing audio descriptive content in the Yankee territory. In this same period, AD came to be practiced in some European countries, becoming a scientific object in the 1990s, especially in the fields of Translation, Assistive Technology, and Special Education. “Today, in addition to the United States, the countries that invest most in audio description, for both television, film and theater, are

⁸ Text in original: “tecnologia assistiva que permite a inclusão de pessoas com deficiência visual junto ao público de produtos audiovisuais. O recurso consiste na tradução de imagens em palavras. É, portanto, também definido como um modo de tradução audiovisual intersemiótico, onde o signo visual é transposto para o signo verbal.”

England, France, Spain, Germany, Belgium, Canada, Australia, and Argentina” (FRANCO; SILVA, 2010, p.26).⁹

In Brazil, according to the survey carried out by Franco and Silva (2010, pp.23-42), in the volume *Audio Description: Transforming Images into Words*, published in 2010 by the Secretary for the Rights of Persons with Disabilities in the state of São Paulo, AD has been studied mainly at federal universities in Bahia, Pernambuco, and Minas Gerais, and at the Universidade Estadual do Ceará [State University of Ceará]. The efforts are important, but need to be expanded.

The research literature is still very restricted and comprises one article by Franco (2006b) in the magazine *Ciência e Cultura* [Science and Culture] from the Sociedade Brasileira para o Progresso da Ciência – SBPC [Brazilian Society for the Advancement of Science], and three other articles: by Orero (2007), Casado (2007) and Franco (2007a) in a special issue of *TradTerm: Revista do Centro Interdepartamental de Tradução e Terminologia* [Journal of the Interdepartmental Center for Translation and Terminology] at the Universidade de São Paulo - USP [University of São Paulo], organized by Professors Eliana Paes Cardoso Franco (UFBA) and Vera Lúcia Santiago Araújo (UECE). The first article (FRANCO, 2006b) addresses the issue of media accessibility and references closed captions and audio description. The latter three discuss audio subtitling for the opera (ORERO, 2007), audio description from a historical and technical point of view (CASADO, 2007), and the first results of a study on the reception of audio description carried out in the city of Salvador by the TRAMAD (Translation, Media and Audio description) group (FRANCO; SILVA, 2010, pp.33-34).¹⁰

In the field of Communication, one particularly important project is *Cinema ao Pé do Ouvido* [Cinema at the Listener’s Foot], led by Julio Pinto at the Pontifícia Universidade Católica de Minas Gerais [Pontifical Catholic University of Minas Gerais], which has yielded Master’s theses and a dissertation in the field. As for the practice of

⁹ Text in original: “Hoje, além dos Estados Unidos, os países que mais investem na audiodescrição, tanto na televisão como no cinema e no teatro são Inglaterra, França, Espanha, Alemanha, Bélgica, Canadá, Austrália e Argentina.”

¹⁰ Text in original: “A bibliografia específica ainda é muito restrita e resume-se a um artigo de autoria de Franco (2006b) na revista *Ciência e Cultura* da Sociedade Brasileira para o Progresso da Ciência (SBPC), e a outros três artigos: de Orero (2007), Casado (2007) e Franco (2007a) num número especial da *TradTerm: Revista do Centro Interdepartamental de Tradução e Terminologia* da Universidade de São Paulo (USP), organizado pelas Profas. Dras. Eliana Paes Cardoso Franco (UFBA) e Vera Lúcia Santiago Araújo (UECE). O primeiro artigo (FRANCO, 2006b) trata da questão da acessibilidade aos meios e traz referências à legenda fechada e à audiodescrição. Os três últimos discutem a audiodescrição para a ópera (ORERO, 2007), a audiodescrição sob um ponto de vista histórico e técnico (CASADO, 2007), e os primeiros resultados de uma pesquisa de recepção em audiodescrição realizada na cidade de Salvador pelo grupo TRAMAD (Tradução, Mídia e Audiodescrição).”

AD in Brazil, there are two modalities: free courses offered by the private sector and university extension courses or specializations. Both cases use the precepts of the American school of AD, which can be found in *The Audio Description Coalition Standards and Code of Professional Conduct* (2009). This manual contains recommendations such as “what you see is what you describe. You see physical appearance and actions; you do not see motivations or intentions. Never describe what you think you see” (2009, pp.1-2); or, in the section Describe Objectively, instructions such as “Allow listeners to come up with their own opinions and reach their own conclusions. Do not edit, interpret, explain, analyze, or help the ‘listeners’ in any way” (2009, p.2).

There are, of course, reasons for these indications to be applied, especially when the offered description emerges from materials with didactic purposes; it needs to be rapid without inhibiting the listener’s analytical capacity. However, thinking about works of art, whose knowledge, before it is intelligible, is sensitive, is a more intense and vibrant endeavor (MERLEAU-PONTY, 2002),¹¹ for which the American model may not be the most appropriate: it mechanizes emotion and thus usurps from art what is characteristic to it. Just take the AD example presented in the *Revista Brasileira de Tradução Visual* [Brazilian Journal of Visual Translation] for the canvas *Girl with a Pearl Earring*, painted by Jan Vermeer between 1665 and 1667:

The face of a young white girl, in semi-profile, with delicate features, big blue eyes and full lips, slightly open, contrasts with the completely dark background. Her face is turned over her left shoulder. She looks out at the viewer from the painting.

A turban in shades of ultramarine blue and yellow is wrapped around the girl’s head. One end falls from the top of her head to her back. On her shoulders, a robe of earth tones covers a white dress. A large pearl earring hangs from her left ear, in the shape of a drop (ADERALDO, 2011).¹²

¹¹ MERLEAU-PONTY, M. *Phenomenology of Perception*. New York: Routledge, 2002.

¹² Text in original: “O rosto de uma jovem branca, em semi-perfil, com feições delicadas, grandes olhos azuis e lábios carnudos, ligeiramente abertos, contrasta com o fundo totalmente escuro. O rosto está voltado sobre o ombro esquerdo. Ela olha para o espectador do quadro.

Um turbante em tons de azul ultramarino e amarelo está enrolado na cabeça da jovem. Uma cauda desce do alto da cabeça até as costas. Sobre os ombros, um manto em tons de terra, cobre uma vestimenta branca. Da orelha esquerda pende um grande brinco de pérola, em formato de gota.”



Figure 1: Girl with a Pearl Earring

While acknowledging the didactic effectiveness of this description, it is impossible to think that those who listen to it would have an emotion similar to that of someone in front of Vermeer's work. The poetic dimension, necessary to experiencing the canvas, is summarily neglected, and the painting ends up being reduced to a kind of coolly adjectival Cartesian infographic, as boring as only a "semi-profile" can be. In the middle of the last century, there was another proposal in Brazil, captained by the concrete poets: that of the translator's visibility. Thus, names like Haroldo and Augusto de Campos, or even Décio Pignatari, proposed

translation as a form of poetic exercise. The translation of poetry was taken from the modernist backwaters and transformed into a privileged mode of critical-programmatic manifestation. Translation came to be seen as a practically compulsory propaedeutic activity for those wishing to venture into poetic creation. From this perspective, the act of translation is experienced as research and a confrontation of different language models, foreign and Brazilian, capable of mutually fertilizing each other (MORICONI, 1996, p.304).¹³

¹³ Text in original: "tradução como forma de exercício poético. A tradução de poesia foi tirada do remanso modernista e transformada em modo privilegiado de manifestação crítico-programática. Traduzir passou a ser encarado como atividade propedêutica praticamente compulsória para quem pretende aventurar-se pela criação poética. Nessa perspectiva, o ato da tradução é vivenciado como pesquisa e confronto de diferentes modelos de linguagem, estrangeiros e brasileiros, capazes de mutuamente fertilizarem-se."

In this school, the term “trans-creation” or “re-creation,” which can be understood as the translation of one poem into another poem, was rubricated “as the ample creativity of the translator, who usurps the work for their time and place, moving away from literalness” (NÓBREGA, 2006, p.250).¹⁴ The legitimacy of this procedure lies in the fact that, as Haroldo de Campos clarifies in his *Metalinguagem & Outras Metas* [*Metalanguage and Other Aims*] (2010, pp.31-34), art, in that which most characterizes it, points toward itself; it is revealed as a sort of absolute sentence whose content is its own structure—a kind of universe, although multi-vocal, with notes of autism. As a direct consequence of this articulation, art

cannot be translated, as ‘translation implies the possibility of separating meaning and word’ [or meaning and image]. The *place* of translation would thus be ‘the discrepancy between the said and said.’ Translation would point to (...) the less perfect or less absolute (less aesthetic, it might be said) character of the sentence, and it is in this sense that (...) ‘all translation is critical,’ as ‘it is born from the deficiency of the sentence,’ of its insufficiency to stand on its own (FABRI *apud* CAMPOS, 2010, p.32).¹⁵

Faced with this impossibility of translation, the concrete poets opt for the blatant infidelity of re-creating language in another body, or another form. Thus, translation migrates to the category of art or primarily poetic production, whose role is to create something parallel and autonomous, but also reciprocal to the translated object. This was the process followed by Ezra Pound: that of submitting to several dictions, in the unfinished *The Cantos*;¹⁶ in his journey as a translator, the American poet often

betrays the letter of the original (...); but when he does it, and even when he does it not voluntarily, but by blatant error, he is almost always able to—through a kind of miraculous intuition or perhaps a greater solidarity with the diction, with the final *Gestalt* of the work to which he technically adapted his instrument—be faithful to the ‘spirit,’ to the particular ‘climate’ of the translated piece; he adds, as in a continuous sedimentation of creative strata, new effects or variants, which the original authorizes in his line of invention (CAMPOS, 2010, p.32).¹⁷

¹⁴ Text in original: “como criatividade ampla do tradutor, que usurpa a obra para o seu tempo e lugar, afastando-se da literalidade.”

¹⁵ Text in original: “não pode ser traduzida, pois ‘tradução supõe a possibilidade de se separar sentido e palavra’ [ou sentido e imagem]. O lugar da tradução seria, assim, ‘a discrepância entre o dito e o dito’. A tradução apontaria (...) o caráter menos perfeito ou menos absoluto (menos estético, poder-se-ia dizer) da sentença, e é nesse sentido que (...) ‘toda tradução é crítica’, pois ‘nasce da deficiência da sentença’, da sua insuficiência para valer por si mesma.”

¹⁶ POUND, E. *The Cantos of Ezra Pound*. New York: New Directions Books, 1996.

¹⁷ Text in original: “traí a letra do original [...]; mas quando o faz, e ainda quando o faz não por opção voluntária mas por equívoco flagrante, consegue quase sempre - por uma espécie de milagrosa intuição ou talvez de solidariedade maior com a dicção, com a Gestalt final da obra à qual adequou tecnicamente seu

Since audio description is the conversion of visual or audiovisual language to verbal-sonic language, following the concrete poets leads us to conclude that only an aural poem can recreate visual or audiovisual poetics. Here, this poetic is understood, as a basilar clarification, in terms of the semiotics conceived by Jakobson (1962, p.92),¹⁸ the language of open meaning, in which expression and content are tangent; in the case of oral poetry, there is some similarity between sound (expression) and meaning (content). Since it is open, it is fundamental to say it does not mean confused; as Décio Pignatari (2005, p.53) explained in *O que é Comunicação Poética* [*What is Poetic Communication*]: “poetry is situated in the field of sensitive control, in the field of the precision of imprecision. The question of poetry is this: to say imprecise things in a precise manner.”¹⁹

Admitting that in a work of visual or audiovisual art, what one sees—expression—and what one understands or learns—content—are inseparable faces, we defend the idea that for intersemiotic translation, that is, between different languages (PLAZA, 2003), from visual poetry to audio description, it is necessary to use the poetics of sounds. This dimension, neglected by standard AD, is, as Jakobson (1971)²⁰ detailed in the article *Quest for the essence of language*, directly linked to the notion of the icon, in particular to that of the diagram, found in the work by the American philosopher Charles S. Peirce.

Peirce defines diagrams as signs able to represent their object, not by trying to copy the qualities (e.g., color, shape, sound), but by replicating the internal logical relationships presented by the object in the sign (CP 2,277). The concept suggests that, through the construction of sound diagrams, or rather, verbal-sonic poetics, it is possible to grasp, through audio descriptions, the internal relationships that exist in works of visual and audiovisual art. This process maintains the heuristic character necessary for AD, since as thinkers such as Bertrand Russell (2013, p.9) and Frederik Stjernfelt (2010, p.x) observed, diagrams provide inexhaustible sensory findings and learning, as is particular to the arts, which are capable of creating “models for sensitivity and analog thinking” (PIGNATARI, 2005, p.53).²¹ Thus, the diagrammatic adventure, perhaps, is capable of

instrumento - ser fiel ao ‘espírito’, ao ‘clima’ particular da peça traduzida; acrescenta-lhe, como numa contínua sedimentação de estratos criativos, efeitos novos ou variantes, que o original autoriza em sua linha de invenção.”

¹⁸ JAKOBSON, Roman. *Poetry of Grammar and Grammar of Poetry*. In: *Selected Writings 3*. Edited by Stephen Rudy. The Hague: Mouton De Gruyter, 1962.

¹⁹ Source text: “poesia situa-se o campo do controle sensível, no campo da precisão da imprecisão. A questão da poesia é esta: dizer coisas imprecisas de modo preciso.”

²⁰ JAKOBSON, Roman. *Quest for the Essence of Language*. In: *Selected Writings 2*. Edited by Stephen Rudy. The Hague: Mouton De Gruyter, 1971.

²¹ Text in original: “modelos para a sensibilidade e para o pensamento analógico.”

responding to Hilda Hilst's doubt in her *Flux-Phloem* (2003, p.236): "I don't know letters, do they make words? If I say fear, do you sense its smell? If I die, do you see the carcass?"²² Or, applied to our case, "If I describe 'Girl with a Pearl Earring,' do you not only see, but feel the painting?"

2 Towards a Capitoné in AD: Aesthetics, Ethics, and Poetic Language

We believe that liberating AD from its intentional asepsis and introducing it in the pleasures of discursive promiscuity is not only a semiotic issue, but also an aesthetic necessity and an ethical aim. Our argument orbits, particularly, around the articulation indicated by Peirce in 1903, in the text *An Outline Classification of the Sciences*, which Beverley Kent (1987, p.121), an important commentator on this stretch of Peirce's work, calls the definitive version of the American philosopher's classification of the sciences. Peirce organizes them thus: heuristic sciences, revision sciences, and practical sciences. The first investigates exclusively new true facts, taking, as an aim, discovery itself (MARTINEZ, 1999, p.3; BORGES, 2010, p.28), and is summarized as follows (MARTINEZ, 1999; BORGES, 2010; SANTAELLA, 2005 [2001], p.34):

1.1 Mathematics

1.2 Philosophy

1.2.1 Phenomenology

1.2.2 Normative sciences

1.2.2.1 Aesthetics

1.2.2.2 Ethics

1.2.3 Semiotics (synonymous with logic or language)

1.2.3.1 Speculative grammar

1.2.3.2 Logic

1.2.3.3 Speculative rhetoric

1.2.3 Metaphysics

1.3 Special or idioscopic sciences, divided into physical and psychological sciences

²² Text in original: "Não sei de letras, formam palavras? Se eu digo medo, sentes o cheiro? Se eu morro, vê a carcaça?"

This work is not interested in delving into this epistemological path. We want to emphasize, however, the fact that the normative sciences have the function of guiding man, in deliberate action, in the phenomenal world, and that aesthetics, ethics, and logic acquire unique contours in Peircean philosophy (SANTAELLA, 2005). Peirce understands aesthetics as admirable or desirable, a certain ideal end in itself (CP 2,199). Ethics, in turn, must be understood not as the sterile Manichaeism right vs. wrong, but as the actions necessary, even from a practical or material point of view, for achieving the aesthetic ideal. Logic is the thread that mediates aesthetics and ethics, helping us discover the best paths - the best languages - to reach the ethical purposes able to lead us to the aesthetic end.

The concepts introduced above are very abstract, as Peircean philosophy is not concerned with any phenomenon in particular— and it is thus necessary to come down to Earth. In the problem that interests us, that of audio description, we can understand aesthetics as the desire for the sonic replicability of visuality, as faithful as possible. Ethics is intertwined with the procedures or protocols we must take to achieve this end. Is it important, for example, to use a translation of authorship, deliberately and blatantly subjective, to preserve the poetic dimension of an audio description? Having established the aesthetic aims and the ethical purposes, language or logic will indicate the most appropriate semiotic methods to achieve them.

Based on everything that we have argued until this point, when we are faced with the attempt to translate images into words—an aesthetic paradigm—the only route we can propose for the audio description of visual and audiovisual works of art is re-creation. This route apparently collides with the translator's ethics, whose role, according to the existing manuals for audio descriptive practice, should be that of a mechanical and accurate eye, rather than a human eye. We believe not only that the ethical model of the absent translator is puerile and outdated, but that it sabotages the aesthetic ideal, the ultimate end of any audio description: converting the visual into the verbal-sonic. This leads us to articulate a certain revision of translational ethics for AD.

In the stage in which it is found, this ethics destroys the aesthetic experience, the sensory and cognitive apprehension of the person listening to an audio description of a canvas, a photograph, or an opera, preventing the listener from sonically reconstructing the audio describer's visual enjoyment. If only a poem can translate another poem, if diagrammatic signs, although a subjective creation, are able to pour out the visual qualities in sound, introducing semiotic processes of discovery, and if all this can still

superimpose, to some extent, an objective description of what is presented to the eyes, an unprecedented multi-vocality in which the poetic is preserved and information is added to it, the proposal by authors, such as Pound, Joyce, the Campos brothers and Décio Pignatari, seems most relevant. The AD prototyped in textbooks inevitably becomes secondhand language - which is ethically reprehensible!

Final Considerations

Taking polyphony as a semiotic fact implies that no speech is an immaculate virgin. The poetic, the sacred, the practical, prose, and all other modalities of language encounter and contaminate each other, in an often uncomfortable multi-vocality, capable of suspending the security of our airtight, and sometimes simplistic, classifications of communication phenomena. This does not suggest admitting parity between the typologies of signs, for example, that the poetic and the instrumental are equivalent. However, it allows us to escape the purist practices that tend to imprison what is, by nature, free.

Evoking this freedom for the audio description of visual and audiovisual works of art liberates this practice from a sealed and sterile place, whether that of frigid objectivity, or that of a frantic hermeneutics, supported by unlimited subjectivism. In proposing recreation as a procedure, we believe, to some extent, in being able to escape this dichotomy and, thus, restoring the necessary aesthetic, ethical, and semiotic relationships of AD, doing greater justice to that which is its fundamental end: letting someone see with their ears.

This purpose is precisely the aesthetic thread of AD, which is currently barred by the default norm, the object of our criticism and is, as we have discussed, ethically wrong. Having demystified the confusion between the poetic – the precision of imprecision or the control of sensitivity - and the arbitrary, having reestablished that it is permissible to make the act of translating an active process of creation, and recognizing that only a poem can translate another poem, and that this allows free judgment, the unexpected discovery of those listening to it, it seems legitimate for us to indicate verbal-sonic poetry as the most appropriate language for achieving the aesthetic aim of the audio description of visual and audiovisual works of art. And here, synthesized, is our final argument.

REFERENCES

- ADERALDO, M. F. Audiodescrição do quadro de Vermeer. In: *Revista Brasileira de Tradução Visual*, América do Norte, 6, mar. 2011. Disponível em: <http://www.rbtv.associadosdainclusao.com.br/index.php/principal/article/view/79/122>. Acesso em 31 Ago.2015.
- BAKHTIN, M. Hacia una metodología de las ciencias humanas. In: *Estética de la creación verbal*. Trad. Tatiana Bubnova. Buenos Aires: Sigla Veintuno, 1982, p.381-396
- BAKHTINE, M. *La poétique de Dostoiévski*. Trad. Isabelle Kolitcheff. Paris: Seul, 1970.
- BORGES, P. M. *Mensagens cifradas: a construção de linguagens diagramáticas*. 2010. 278 f. Tese. (Doutorado em Comunicação e Semiótica) Pontifícia Universidade Católica de São Paulo, São Paulo.
- BRAIT, B. *Literatura e outras linguagens*. São Paulo: Contexto, 2010.
- BRASIL. Ministério das Comunicações. Portaria 310/2006. Disponível em: <http://www.mc.gov.br/o-ministerio/legislacao/portarias/portaria-310.pdf>. Acesso em: 03 jan. 2014.
- CAMPOS, H. *Metalinguagem & outras metas*. São Paulo: Perspectiva, 2010.
- FRANCO, E. *Audiodescrição e audiodescritores: Quem é Quem?*, 2007. Disponível em: <http://elianafranco.wordpress.com/> Acesso em: 22 dez. 2013
- FRANCO, E; SILVA, M. C. C. C. Audiodescrição: breve passeio histórico In: *Audiodescrição: transformando imagens em palavras*. São Paulo: Secretaria dos Direitos da Pessoa com Deficiência do Estado de São Paulo, 2010.
- HILST, H. Uma superfície de gelo ancorada no riso. In: *Antologia de Hilda Hilst*. Seleção, organização e apresentação de Luisa Destri. São Paulo: Globo, 2012.
- JAKOBSON, R. À procura da essência da linguagem. In: *Linguística e comunicação*. São Paulo: Cultrix, 1995, p.98-117.
- _____. *Linguística; poética; cinema*. São Paulo: Perspectiva, 1970.
- KENT, B. E. *Charles S. Peirce: Logic and the Classification of the Sciences*. Kingston and Montreal: Queen's University Press, 1987.
- LIMA, F. *Áudio-descrição: arte e linguagem a serviço da pessoa com deficiência visual*. Disponível em: <http://www.lerparaver.com/node/10690>. Acesso em: 12 dez. 2013.
- MARTINEZ, J. L. Música, semiótica musical e a classificação das ciências de Charles Sanders Peirce. *Revista Opus*, n. 6, 1999.
- MERLEAU-PONTY, M. *Fenomenologia da percepção*. Trad. C. Moura. São Paulo: Martins Fontes, 1994 [1945].
- MESCHONNIC, H. *Poética do traduzir*. Trad. Jerusa Pires Ferreira e Suely Fenerich. São Paulo, Perspectiva: 2010.
- MORICONI, I. Pós-modernismo e tradução de poesia em inglês no Brasil. In: *CONGRESSO ABRALIC*, 5, 1996, Rio de Janeiro. *Cânones & Contextos*, 5º Congresso Abralic – Anais. Rio de Janeiro: Abralic, 1997, v. 1, p.303-309.
- NÓBREGA, T. M. Transcrição e hiperfidelidade. In: *Cadernos de Literatura em Tradução*, n. 7, 2006, p.249-255.

- PEIRCE, C. S. *The Collected Papers of Charles S. Peirce*. Edição eletrônica reproduzindo Vols. I-VI [Ed. Hartshorne, C. & Weiss, P., Cambridge: Harvard University, 1931-1935], Vols. VII-VIII [Ed. Burks, A. W. Cambridge: Harvard University, 1958]. Charlottesville: Intalex Corporation, 1994 [1866-1913].
- PIGANATARI, D. *O que é comunicação poética*. Cotia: Ateliê Editorial, 2005.
- PLAZA, J. *Tradução intersemiótica*. São Paulo: Perspectiva, 2003.
- RUSSEL, B. *História do pensamento ocidental*. São Paulo: Saraiva, 2013. (Coleção Saraiva de Bolso).
- SANTAELLA, L. O admirável estético e ético como ideal supremo da vida humana. In: SILVA, J. A. (Org.). *Encontros estéticos*. São Paulo: Caixa Econômica, 2005.
- SNYDER, J. Audio Description: The Visual Made Verbal. In: *International Congress Series Volume 1282, Vision 2005 — Proceedings of the International Congress held between 4 and 7 April 2005, in London, UK, September 2005*, pp.935–939.
- STJERNFELT, F. *Diagrammatology: An Investigation on the Borderlines of Phenomenology, Ontology, and Semiotics*. The Netherlands: Springer, 2007.
- TEZZA, C. *Entre a prosa e a poesia: Bakhtin e o formalismo russo*. Rio de Janeiro: Rocco, 2003.
- THE Audio Description Coalition Standards for Audio Description and Code of Professional Conduct for Descriptor. Disponível em: <<http://www.audiodescriptioncoalition.org>>. Acesso em: 01 fev. 2014.
- TODOROV, T. Prefácio. In: BAKHTIN, M. *Estética da criação verbal*. Trad. Maria Ermantina Galvão G. Pereira. São Paulo: Martins Fontes, 1997, p.1-21.
- TROTSKY, L. A escola poética formalista e o marxismo. In: *Teoria da literatura: formalistas russos*. Porto Alegre: Editoria Globo, 1971.

Received March 10,2015

Accepted August 22,2015