

Volume 43 | Número 1 | Ano 2022

Virtual exchange and communication in English as a lingua franca: a case study from the State University of Northern Paraná

Intercâmbio virtual e comunicação em inglês como língua franca: um estudo de caso da Universidade Estadual do Norte do Paraná

> Micheli Gomes de, SOUZA (UENP)¹ Neri de Souza, SANTANA (UEL)²

RESUMO

O objetivo deste artigo é descrever os processos e resultados de uma iniciativa de intercâmbio virtual conduzida pelo Centro Internacional de Idiomas da Universidade Estadual do Norte do Paraná (UENP), Brasil, em parceria com a UGMEX Campus Pluviosilla, México, considerando suas contribuições e desafios para o desenvolvimento da consciência linguística e intercultural por meio de parcerias transnacionais, comunicação em inglês como língua franca (ILF) e políticas de internacionalização em casa. A parceria foi realizada durante os primeiros meses da pandemia COVID-19, que impactou a rotina regular de alunos e professores das duas instituições. O estudo de caso apresentado aqui é teoricamente fundamentado em estudos sobre práticas de intercâmbio virtual, internacionalização e ensino de língua inglesa, conduzidos por autores como Telles e Vassallo (2009), Salomão (2020), O'Dowd (2017, 2018), Cavalari (2018), e autores sobre ILF como Jenkins (2000, 2006, 2009), KirkPatrick (2006), Seidlhofer (2001). A metodologia de pesquisa é baseada na abordagem qualitativa de análise dos dados gerados via aplicativos Google, pelos instrutores e participantes, tais como os diários das sessões. A análise indicou algumas limitações das atividades assíncronas propostas e o potencial e demandas pedagógicas para a consolidação da experiência de intercâmbio virtual entre as instituições.

Palavras-Chave: Telecolaboração, Inglês, Internacionalização em casa, ILF.

ABSTRACT

This article aims at describing the processes and outcomes of a virtual exchange initiative carried out by the International Language Center of the State University of Northern Paraná (UENP), Brazil, in partnership with UGMEX Campus Pluviosilla, Mexico, considering its contributions and challenges for the development of learners' linguistic and intercultural awareness by means of transnational partnerships, English as a lingua franca (ELF) communication, and internationalization at home policies. The partnership was held during the first months of the COVID-19 pandemic, which impacted the students and teachers' regular routines in both institutions. The case study presented here is theoretically grounded on studies on virtual exchange practices, internationalization and English language teaching, conducted by authors such as Telles and Vassallo (2009), Salomão (2020), O'Dowd (2017, 2018), Cavalari (2018),

¹ State University of Northern Paraná, Jacarezinho, Paraná, Brazil. Center of Letras, Communication and Arts; ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3111-9613; souzagomes.micheli@gmail.com.

² State University of Londrina, Londrina, Paraná, Brazil. Postgraduate Program in Language Studies; ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2301-8513; neri.souza.santana@uel.br.



and ELF authors such as Jenkins (2000, 2006, 2009), Kirkpatrick (2006), Seidlhofer (2001). The research methodology is based on a qualitative approach of analysis of the data generated through Google applications, by the instructors and participants, such as the sessions diaries. The analysis indicated some limitations in asynchronous activities proposed and the pedagogical potential and demands for the consolidation of the virtual exchange between the institutions.

Keywords: *Telecollaboration, English, Internationalization at home, ELF.*

1. Introduction

Language learning practices and contexts have been greatly impacted by the development of digital communication technologies. The popularization of mobile gadgets and wireless connection has facilitated synchronous and multimodal interactions between learners from distant geographical areas as never before. Considering this stage many researchers and educators have looked for the implementation of innovative contexts of learning, aiming at promoting learners' autonomy, and communication and intercultural abilities (TELLES; VASSALLO, 2006; THORNE, 2016; DOOLY; O'DOWD, 2018).

In university language education, practices named e-tandem, telecollaboration, collaborative online international learning, online intercultural exchange, global virtual teams, among others, have had a long history, dating from the first years of the emergence of the Internet. For O'Dowd (2018) all these practices characterize the concept of virtual exchange. According to O'Dowd, Sauro and Spector-Cohen (2019, p. 1-2), virtual exchange (VE), which broadly describes the practice presented in this article, refers to the "sustained engagement of groups of learners in online intercultural interaction and collaboration projects with partners from other cultural contexts or geographical locations as an integrated part of their educational programmes." Considering the collaboration and distance as common aspects of these practices, here we also use the term "telecollaboration" to refer to our virtual exchange experience. Virtual exchange can cover a large scope of academic subjects, and, in this article, we focus on an initiative carried out for the collaboration between learners of English from a Brazilian and a Mexican university.

In terms of telecollaborative programs focused on language learning, the teletandem context, which inspired and informed our telecollaborative experience, has had an important role in the intercultural education field. Teletandem (TELLES; VASSALLO, 2006) is a context of telecollaborative practice of foreign languages in-tandem between pairs of learners through multimodal webconference tools such as Skype and Google Meet. Based on principles of autonomy and reciprocity, this context has been explored by higher education institutions worldwide to promote partnerships between learners



interested in studying each other's language of proficiency or native languages³. So, the context expects the practice of at least two languages, with separate moments for the practice of each one and with learners taking turns as the most expert (that is, the most proficient or native) speaker and as the learner of their partner's language of proficiency or native language.

We consider the focus on the practice of two languages in the context of teletandem as the main characteristic that differentiates it from the virtual exchange experience we describe in this article, since the learning partnerships we promoted were carried out between students from Brazil and from Mexico aiming at developing their proficiency in the same target language, English, which both were learning as a foreign language in their academic contexts. However, the principles and modalities of teletandem have also grounded our experience, since it is a pioneering telecollaborative context aimed at promoting autonomous and transnational language learning experiences.

According to O'Dowd (2018), in order to improve the effectiveness of virtual exchange programs in foreign language contexts, it is important to understand how their models and tasks are designed, and how they are integrated into the formal learning process. Adding to that, we claim that it is also important to analyse the institutional settings in which such programs are implemented and their political and pedagogical impacts on the context of English as a foreign language teaching.

Considering the studies that have shown the contributions and challenges of telecollaborative practices for language learning and for the internationalization of higher education institutions (TELLES; VASSALO, 2006; GARCIA, 2020; SALOMÃO; FREIRE JUNIOR, 2020; O'DOWD, 2017; RABELLO, 2020), this article aims at describing the processes and outcomes of the first virtual exchange initiative carried out by the International Language Center of the State University of Northern Paraná (UENP/Brazil) in partnership with UGMEX Campus Pluviosilla, Mexico. By sharing the results of this partnership, focusing on the Brazilian university experience, we hope to contribute to improvements and consolidation of the role of virtual exchange for the development of English learners' linguistic and intercultural awareness, by means of transnational partnerships, English as a lingua franca communication, and "internationalization at home" policies.

2. Internationalization at home in higher education and virtual exchange

De Wit (2016, p. 76 apud CAVALARI, 2018, p. 421) defines the term "internationalization at home" as "curriculum-oriented activities that help students develop international understanding and intercultural skills and that prepare students to be active in a much more globalized world." Beelen and

³³ For a discussion on the notion of native speaker in the Teletandem context, see Alves (2021), in her study that analyses Brazilian participants' beliefs about the native speaker of English in teletandem.



Jones (2015, p. 69) consider Internationalization at Home (capitalized by the authors) as any "[...] purposeful integration of international and intercultural dimensions into the formal and informal curriculum for all students within domestic learning environments." Both definitions highlight the integration of international and intercultural activities and practices into the curriculum as an essential part of the concept. This characteristic of the term suggest the importance and possible contributions of virtual exchange programs for the promotion of intercultural learning experiences among students from diverse backgrounds.

The relationship between virtual exchange and internationalization in academic settings has been the object of special attention in the research agenda of educators and policy makers around the world (CAVALARI, 2018; SALOMÃO, 2020; GARCIA, 2020; O'DOWD, 2018). According to O'Dowd and Beaven (2019, p. 15), "In international education, VE has great potential to foster a range of 21st-century employability skills including media and digital literacy, communication skills, global awareness, empathy, critical and analytical thinking, foreign language skills and intercultural competences and it can also be used to supplement and enhance universities' physical exchange programmes."

A study named EVALUATE (Evaluating and Upscaling Telecollaborative Teacher Education), carried out within the European Erasmus+ KA3 programme, from 2017 to 2018, aimed at supporting virtual exchange initiatives involving over 1000 students in the field of initial teacher education by training 34 initial teacher training institutions and supporting them along the experience. The main purpose of this study, described by O'Dowd and Beaven (up. cit.), was to examine the contributions of virtual exchange "[...] to the development of competences which student teachers need in order to teach, collaborate and innovate effectively in a digitalised and cosmopolitan world." According to the authors, the results of the study show that the virtual exchange surpasses the development of learners' intercultural, digitalpedagogical and linguistic competences and contributes to the innovation and internationalization of the university classroom. The authors highlight, however, that virtual exchange "[...] is a complex learning activity which requires integration into a formal educational framework and that the growth of virtual exchange depends on the provision of increased training and support from institutions and educational decision-makers." (O'DOWD; BEADEN, 2019, p. 16).

Experiences of virtual exchange in undergraduate and graduate programs in Brazil have grown exponentially. Salomão (2020) affirms that the increasing demand for the creation of professional and learning collaborations among universities shaped the constitution of the program BRaVE (Brazilian Virtual Exchange), created by the Brazilian Association for International Education (FAUBAI). According to the author, this program aims at promoting intercultural exchange of ideas between groups of Brazilian undergraduate and graduate students and foreign students in different academic institutions



and correlated subject areas. The experience described between UNESP (São Paulo State University) and other institutions indicates the contributions and adaptability of virtual exchange practices to attend the demands of different pedagogical interests and to accommodate shared learning goals across international partners.

Regarding virtual exchange programs aimed at forming partnerships between language learners, as we have highlighted in the introduction, since 2006 the Teletandem Brazil group has been contributing to the popularization of the tandem mode of learning, focused on the principles of autonomy and reciprocity, and suitable for the online context by the use of multimodal tools of communication (TELLES; VASSALLO, 2009). Teletandem experience has grounded the actions of several telecollaboration initiatives in Brazil and around the world. Garcia (2020) describes her experience conducting telecollaborative partnerships in English as a lingua franca based on the background Teletandem offers in terms of theoretical achievements registered in several studies⁴ and on the expertise of the group in the management of interinstitutional partnerships and in the promotion of pedagogical mediation.

Given vitual exchange's large spectrum of possibilities for the establishment of transcontinental student-centered partnerships, regarding levels of integration into courses' curriculums, types of partnerships, between groups or pairs of students from the same or different subject areas, we believe it contributes to the institutional policies of internationalization. In the area of language learning, studies have shown the challenges and contributions of such practices (COSTA, SALOMÃO, ZAKIR, 2018; RABELLO, 2020). Considering the integration of teletandem practice into the classrooms of undergraduate courses of languages or related areas of UNESP (the Assis, Araraquara and São José do Rio Preto campuses, in Brazil), Cavalari (2018) reveals low levels of integration of teletandem into the curriculums in these academic contexts. The author suggests that the integration of telecollaboration into the curriculum of a course is a step in the direction of institutional recognition. Cavalari (2018) highlights, however, that there is no evidence that this integration of virtual exchange into the curriculum is recognized as a strategy for internationalization at home.

Considering its novelty in the scope of the actions of the International Language Center of the State University of Northern Paraná and the nature of the courses offered in this context, the experience described in this study was not integrated into the curriculum of any undergraduate course of the Brazilian institution, but rather was integrated for the participants from the partner institution, UGMEX. As we describe in the following sections, at UENP it was offered as an opportunity for students from different undergraduate courses. Considering our interest in exploring the contributions and role of virtual exchange

⁴ Available at: http://www.teletandembrasil.org/publications.html



for the consolidation of internationalization at home more fully, here we reflect on the local outcomes and challenges for future editions of our UENP-UGMEX partnership.

3. English as a lingua franca through virtual exchange

The first studies on ELF took place in the 1980s, with studies by Jenkins (2000) and Seidlhofer (2001) when they started to question the real effectiveness of teaching English from the native speaker model and to think about a break with the normative culture in the teaching of English to conjecture a more appropriate practice to multilingual contexts (DUBOC, 2019). Thus, the term "lingua franca", also known as "contact language", "auxiliary language", "language of commerce" and "commercial jargon", was first used to express a linguistic variety used in the Mediterranean, being used among peoples of that region as a form of communication (JENKINS, 2000; COGO; DEWEY, 2011).

Seidlhofer's (2001) first definition of ELF was what she considered a language without native speakers. However, in 2005, she recognized that ELF can occur in interactions between native speakers and non-native speakers of English and, in 2011, changed the definition of ELF to use English as a means of communication between speakers of different mother tongues. In other words, the ELF is the use of English in contexts that demand the need for communication between speakers from different locations who have this particular language in common and as the best form of communication (COGO and DEWEY, 2012). ELF is used among multilingual speakers in contextualized practices as a specific context of language use (DUBOC, 2019).

In the conception of Jenkins, Cogo and Dewey (2012), ELF is part of the standard English used for communication in a global sphere, regardless of whether it is a language spoken between native or non-native speakers of English. ELF considers English speakers simply as different and not as users who use it correctly or incorrectly, but who use it as a form of communication. In short, ELF is seen as an ideal reference for those who learn English for communicative purposes, since the objective is to communicate rather than acquire an idealized standard. In addition, global cultural issues could be covered, as opposed to just the culture of the native English speaker. English as a lingua franca has become the property of everyone who makes use of it, so this suggests that the reflection on its users' cultural norms tends to be flexible (KIRKPATRICK, 2006).

Another point is that language is constantly changing, and English evolves even faster with the diversification of English users. Then, particularly when English is used as a lingua franca between speakers of other languages, native-speaker norms and usages may not be relevant or the main concern in such a context (JENKINS, 2006). So, we agree that the target model for English learners in non-Englishspeaking countries, as argued in the emerging ELF paradigm, should start to shift from native speakers to



bilingual or multilingual speakers (PAKIR, 2009). The experiences with virtual exchange may encompass cultural content, enabling the expansion of international and local cultures so that they can value the variations between the speakers involved in the process of communication.

English has still been taught as a foreign language, with some learners expecting that the purpose of learning English is to use it with native speakers (JENKINS, 2006), so it is natural that, for a long time, virtual exchange experiences have been thought as a way of engaging students in exchange activities with others who belong to countries like the United States and England. This project, on the other hand, is an attempt to break with such a scenario and offer Brazilian and Mexican students a unique experience of non-native speaker online communication in order to broaden students' conceptions of the roles of English, especially in their daily and personal life.

Ke and Cahyani, 2014, presents a study from 2010 that demonstrates that some students who had contact with native speakers in inner-circle countries did not increase their confidence in English and felt inferior when speaking to native speakers. Some students felt that their native speaker peers had, overall, a much superior English level compared to theirs, neglecting the fact that English was their first language. Conversely, those who experienced international contact in a non-English-speaking country reported enhanced confidence in their own English. They realized that they were able to use English to communicate with other ELF users with confidence and noticed the important role of English as a lingua franca. The study suggested that non-native speakers' interactions facilitated the development of students' new beliefs about the roles of English in their lives.

Graddol (2006, apud O'DOWD, 2018, p. 7) points out that, from an educational perspective, it is also important to consider that modern university graduates are progressively likely to use a language such as English not only with native speakers, but also with non-native speakers as a lingua franca in their work. In other words, in the global workplace different kinds of professionals will be required to show intercultural and linguistic skills to use English for online collaborative work with other non-native speakers just as much, if not more, as with native speakers.

In another study, Garcia (2020) defends the idea of offering a virtual exchange by using English as a lingua franca on different occasions throughout the year, through class rotation, as it allows Brazilian students to access different nationalities and cultures for each new class. The diversity of countries and areas of study fosters the exchanges established and allows fruitful construction of knowledge, extrapolating language learning as an end in itself (GARCIA, 2020).

The case described in this study, regarding the use of ELF in a virtual exchange experience among Brazilian and Mexican students, showed us the advantages of this kind of practice in the scholar's improvement of spoken language for the purpose of communication. The participants reported feeling



more confident and motivated to talk to their partners since they were both learning English and had much to offer each other. ELF has started to be added in English classes at the International Language Center of the State University of Northern Paraná and this study contributes greatly to this implementation. Continuing our interest in scrutinizing the role of virtual exchange practices in language education more entirely, we discuss next the case study between UENP and UGMEX.

4. Case study: UENP and UGMEX partnership

The UENP and UGMEX experience analyzed here can be described as a case study (ANDRÉ, 1989; YIN, 2009). A case study is a methodology to guide investigations of an individual, specific, well delimited case, contextualized in a time and place, which includes a detailed search of information. For the scope of this investigation, geared towards analyzing the results of UENP and UGMEX virtual experience, case study was used given our necessity of understanding the specificities of this virtual exchange partnership in our context.

We focus on conducting a qualitative analysis of the data generated during the first virtual exchange experience between the International Language Center of UENP (CII) and UGMEX, named I CII & UGMEX Virtual Exchange: English for International Communication. For this purpose, we organize the analysis in three parts, guided by the following questions: (1) What were the main characteristics of the virtual exchange promoted?; (2) What were the most recurrent themes in the Brazilian learners' reports about their learning experiences?; (3) How do they relate to the specificities of the virtual exchange in English as a lingua franca?

In order to answer the first question, we analyse data from Google Classroom, teachers' field notes, and we rely on our experience as the developers of the program and goals of the virtual exchange activities, as pedagogical coordinators of the International Language Center. The first goal is to describe the structure, participants, tools, processes and pedagogical objectives of the virtual exchange experience.

The goals of questions 2 and 3 are to identify the recurrent themes approached by the learners in the descriptions of their experiences and explore their relationship with the characteristics of the virtual exchange in English as a lingua franca. For this purpose, we analyse Brazilian participants' session diaries and our field notes of mediation sessions. In the sections below, we present the analysis and discussion of the study's results.



4.1 The first UENP-UGMEX virtual experience with English as a lingua franca

The program consisted of pairing learners of English as a foreign language from both universities to provide them a telecollaborative context for the development of their communication and intercultural skills. A total of thirty-three pairs were formed, twenty-five pairs completed the interactions, and three English teachers were involved in the pedagogical mediation of the partners' activities and interpersonal relations. Students were expected to do a minimum of twelve hours of synchronous audio and video interactions through web conferencing tools and eight hours of teacher-designed tasks such as discussion forums and session diaries through Google Forms.

The program was integrated into the curriculum of the English courses of the "Licenciatura en Lengua Inglesa" and "Licenciatura en Lenguas", for the UGMEX's students. At UENP, it was offered as a non-integrated activity open for English learners and learners from the institution interested in the opportunity of interacting in English telecollaboratively. As an integrated activity for UGMEX students, the virtual exchange experience was part of the evaluative activities in their courses, however we did not have access to how they were evaluated and details of how the virtual exchange activities integrated the curriculum of their courses. Aware of our reality and of the uncertainties caused by the COVID-19 pandemic, the partner teacher was flexible and negotiated the activities and the workload of the interactions with us, and agreed with our decision to let students choose the themes of their sessions.

Being a non-integrated activity for UENP learners means they were volunteers, from different undergraduate courses and had diverse levels of proficiency. They received a certificate of completion for the experience and were not graded for their participation, which was not part of the curriculum of any specific undergraduate course, but an optional activity offered by the institution's International Language Center. In the table below, we summarize the main characteristics of the virtual exchange and of the participants involved in the program, focusing on our institution's scenario.

Table 1. UGMEX-UENP virtual experience main characteristics

	UGMEX	UENP
Modality of partnership	Integrated to the undergraduate courses: "Licenciatura en Lenguas" and "Licenciatura en Lengua Inglesa"	Non-integrated to any regular courses of the institution, but offered as an English course recognized and supported by the institution's International Language Center, an extension program aimed at promoting foreign language courses to UENP's internal and external community.



Institutional recognition	Administrative support from the International Relations Office	Administrative support and infrastructure from the Coordination of International Relations
Duration	03 months (May - July)	
Telecollaborative sessions	12 hours of autonomous synchronous interactions, weekly distributed according to each pair's availability.	
Teachers involved	01 lecturer (temporary contract) of English and French and coordinator of the project "UGMEX Proyectándose Internacionalmente", at UGMEX Campus Pluviosilla and Campus Córdoba.	02 lecturers (temporary contract) of English and pedagogical coordinators of the International Language Center at UENP campus Jacarezinho and campus Cornélio Procópio.
Students involved	33 undergraduate students of the courses "Licenciatura en Lenguas" and "Licenciatura en Lengua Inglesa"	33 undergraduate students from different areas and English learners.
Tools used	E-mail, Skype, Google Classroom, WhatsApp, Google Meet.	
Mediation and pedagogical support	- 01 Orientation session (Google Meet)	
	 Pedagogical support in the classes of Licenciatura en Lenguas. Session diaries Discussion forums on Google Classroom 	 - 01 Roundtable: Sharing your Learning Experiences - Session diaries and discussion forums on Google Classroom.
	- 01 Evaluation and Farewell Session (Google Meet)	

Source: Elaborated by the authors

The first contact between the institutions was the result of a visit of the coordinator of the Coordination of International Relations (CRI - UENP) to UGMEX that aimed to form new partnerships and contribute to the internationalization policies of the institution. Considering the existence of undergraduate courses of Languages (Letras) and of the International Language Center at UENP, as well as similar conditions at UGMEX, this partnership was possible and aimed at giving language learners the chance to communicate telecollaboratively to develop their linguistic and intercultural skills.

The three-month partnership described here was impacted by the contextual conditions of the pandemic. To form the partnerships, UGMEX's teacher provided us with a list of basic information about their students: their name, English level of proficiency and contact information. Based on that, by way of a Google Form we opened registration for students from UENP and from its CII. We decided not to apply any placement test, so we paired students according to their indicated levels, forming mostly basic -



intermediate and intermediate - intermediate partnerships. During the process, some partnerships had to be changed according to the availability of the students, regardless of their levels of proficiency, due to reported give-ups from our students, justified by classes returning to the remote format, which required them to greatly adjust their schedules. The most direct impact of the pandemic was the Brazilian students' high interest, since the partnership was promoted at the very beginning of the pandemic when their regular in-person classes had been suspended and they were able to better adjust the interactions to their routines. This telecollaborative initiative, offered to all the institution's students, was the first of its kind. Previous Teletandem experiences had already been implemented, but were restricted to undergraduate students of Languages (Portuguese and English) and, as expected, were bilingual.

After the establishment of the partnerships, each pair received an email introducing each member of the pair, with their contact information and basic guidelines, such as: (1) Contact your partner introducing yourself, indicating your availability (hour and day) for the first session and the tool to be used (e.g. Skype, Whatsapp). Don't forget to consider the time difference between Brazil and Mexico; (2) Choose an appropriate place with a good internet connection for the sessions; (3) Adjust the video and audio settings of your computer or cellphone; (4) In the first session, define a fixed schedule for the sessions and share your English learning experiences, goals, and plans for the partnership; (5) Decide on some themes of common interest and plan some strategies you can use to conduct the conversation sessions.

The pedagogical mediation of the partnerships was conducted through synchronous and asynchronous activities. The first orientation session, offered to all the participants, focused on providing an overview of the characteristics of telecollaboration and its contribution to English learning. The three teachers participated in this session and contributed with guidelines about learning strategies, principles of the interactions, such as autonomy and reciprocity, and about the Google Classroom activities participants were expected to do. Along the whole process, learners kept contact with the mediators through email and Google Classroom, sending them weekly session diaries and participating in a discussion forum. The forum aimed at creating a collective dialogue about learning experiences, however, we observed a very low participation. Other interactional activities with the whole group were the recording of a 1-minute introductory video on Flipgrid and participation in the written forum "Introducing ourselves". We consider that these asynchronous tasks were not successfully implemented and we concluded that learners were more interested in the interactions with their partners.

The experience of the synchronous mediation sessions were conducted in three moments: the orientation session, already described, a roundtable discussion with Brazilian learners, and a final evaluation and farewell session. Although we did not have 100% attendance in any of these sessions, we



believe they were very rich and the most favorable space, along with the session diaries, to identify the learners' issues regarding their experiences. Each of them lasted about 1 to 2 hours and, except for the first one, which was more teacher-centered, the last two sessions were conducted through open questions for students about their experiences. The most common experiences shared were related to what they talked about and to how the characteristics of the partnerships contributed to their development. One aspect that we highlight here is the predominance of a comparative approach to the discussion of themes during their interactions. Learners reported sharing cultural knowledge about Mexico that they had constructed from their experiences watching Mexican soap operas and sitcoms that are popular in Brazil, and comparing their knowledge to what their Mexican partners knew about Brazilian culture, music, etc.

Considering the overview presented of the main characteristics of this first virtual exchange, in the following section, we analyse the main focus of this article, observing what for us was the most important and challenging aspect of the partnership: the perspective of English as a lingua franca and how we can part from the main themes and experiences reported in the learners' diaries to discuss what the experience of virtual exchange in ELF demands from us in future endeavors of the program.

4.2 Learners' experiences in virtual exchange in English as a lingua franca

The goal of this section is to present the results of an analysis of the Brazilian learners' session diaries, complemented by the Brazilian mediators' field notes and observations of the Brazilian students in the mediation sessions. The focus of the analysis was to identify the most recurrent themes discussed in the sessions and analyse the implications of English as a lingua franca for virtual exchange.

Regarding the most recurrent topics in the sessions, we verified through the students' diaries that they talked mostly about: their lifestyle and routine, the virtual exchange experience, the COVID-19 pandemic, about their origin countries, learning experiences, strategies, and resources used in their sessions. In the following table, we present the most illustrative excerpts of each theme⁵.

Table 2. Brazilian learners' sessions diaries: recurrent themes

Theme	Excerpts
(A) Lifestyle and routine	(1) She told me about some problems on her job, we talked about some activities in my job and other daily routines we usually do on the week

⁵ For the analysis, we identify the excerpts according to the themes (A, B, C, D, E) and the number of the excerpts (1, 2, 3...). For example: A:1. We omitted any of the participants' personal information from the excerpts and highlighted keywords or phrases in each one. We also kept the excerpts as they were written, correcting only mistakes that mostly compromised comprehension. Considering learners shared their session diaries through a Google form and that most of them used a cellphone, many excerpts have issues regarding capitalization and punctuation.

http://revistas.pucsp.br/esp

DOI: 2318-7115.2022v43i1a13



	(2) [] we dived on regional recipes, hobbies, a relation of the weather [] about songs, games that we like, parents [] What games we are playing, things we dislike like, I am not being a fan of eggs and him of people that are late [] About cooking too, what we had for breakfast, he sent me a video of him making a pizza and it goes on. (3) We talked about our online classes and how they work [] about our routine, for example, what we would cook for dinner and lunch. The most curious thing is that we have almost the same routine including our tastes for food ⁶ . (Our translation).
(B) COVID-19 pandemic	 (1) [] and COVID-19.[] about how are things are going on with the pandemic, like the government, their actions, people itself disrespecting some rules of the quarantine. (2) [] my partner and his family are suspected of having COVID-19 (3) Also about the Coronavirus facts and political dealing of it in our countries.
(C) Virtual exchange experience	(1) We were a little nervous about being on our first date, but we managed to communicate and correct some mistakes we made in our lines. This meeting served to get to know each other better and I'm sure we will learn a lot from each other and we will improve our English skills together. (2) [] that we are happy with the interactions. We're getting along really well. (3) It was our last talk, we talked about how this experience was and how much it added to us, for example, the chance of getting to know another culture and being able to improve our English in a more natural way, talking about things we both liked ⁷ . (Our translation)
(D) Brazil and Mexico	(1) My partner and I talk about traditional Brazilian and Mexican fruits, how they are used in each country, we also talk about how the weather was. And we talk about animals that exist only in Brazil and only in Mexico. [] We talked about traditional sweets from Mexico and Brazil, what they are made with. I talked about the June party that takes place in Brazil. I learned about things to do in Mexico when visiting there[] We talked a little more about Carnival in Mexico and Brazil. We talked about Mexican and Brazilian food and some of its differences, such as avocado, which in Brazil is most used for sweet recipes and in Mexico it is used for savory recipes. [] We covered about the difference in climate between Brazil and Mexico, I learned that while in the northern part of Mexico it is cold, the southern part is hot, and that where my partner lives the winter is in January, unlike Brazil. We also talked about the holidays and celebrations in Mexico and Brazil, and their differences. (2) We talk a little bit about our cultures. [] Today we talked about Brazilian customs and foods. I told you a little about how Brazilian carnival is. We also talk about things in her city. [] We talk about famous foods in brazil, mexico and the world. [] I told her about my physical activities and that there would be a "June party". (3) We talked about Pele and also your ex-girlfriend Xuxa rs, but also other players like Neymar, Hulk, Kaka so on. The subjects for the conversation came

⁶ Original: Conversamos sobre a volta às aulas online e como funcionam [...] nossa rotina diária, como por exemplo o que faríamos para comer na janta e no almoço. O mais engraçado é que temos quase a mesma rotina, incluindo o gosto por comida.

⁷ Original: Foi nossa última conversa, falamos sobre como foi essa experiência e o tanto que ela nos acrescentou, como por exemplo a chance de conhecer outra cultura e poder aprimorar o inglês de uma forma mais natural, falando sobre coisas que ambas gostamos.



	up easily. [] In the third season, the topic we started talking about was religion, specifically Christianity [] In this fifth meeting, obviously, the subject was Black Lives Matter. Some time would be. So I told [partner's name] a little about the history of slavery in Brazil and explained how racism is within the structure of Brazilian society, and cases, for example, as Agata, Miguel, Guilherme and others are common in Brazil. We also talked about the indigenous and their languages. I told him that in Brazil there were small groups as Tupinambás, unlike the powerful Aztec Empire, in the region where [partner's name]lives there is a very famous and spoken indigenous language.
(E) Learning strategies and resources used in the sessions	(1) Another theme that we spoke was about English language, its importance [] On this session we spoke about the English language like when and how we get interested in English language for example and also about our experience using the English in our lives and how it can be good to us in different ways. [] On the session we spoke also about some countries that we would like to go in the future to know more about or learn more about the language, like USA, Canada and France. [] On this session we spoke about motivation in learning in and how technology can be used and a important tool to teach and learning a language. (2) On 06/16 I helped [partner's name] with conjunctions in English (though, although, despite, even though, etc.) for a college work he would have to present. It was good, I had the opportunity to review something that I had seen long ago and that I didn't remember very well ⁸ . (Our translation) (3) [] she taught me a lot of grammar about English, she is very kind and helps me a lot in topics that I do not understand well, for example connectors, she taught me every time to use a connector and its characteristics. (4) We talked about where we live in each country, looking in google maps and google images for taking a look at other's town. (5) We struggled sometimes for express some word we didn't know, but I was with an online dictionary open where I was looking for the English word to say correctly.

Source: Elaborated by the authors.

The first recurrent theme we observed was lifestyle and routine. Students shared personal information beginning their first meetings, considering the VE in our context was promoted without any requirements on the themes of the sessions, but as an opportunity for them to talk about their personal tastes, about their families. The decision of keeping the sessions open for the discussion of the themes learners were interested in was made based on the experience of Teletandem and also on the conditions of our institutional partnership, which was not connected to any previously established course curriculum. So, we considered the VE experience as a pedagogically productive context for students to share their life experiences and expand their social interactions through the use of the target language.

⁸ Original: No dia 16/06 eu ajudei [partner 's name] com conjunções em inglês (though, although, despite, even though, etc.) para um trabalho que ele teria que apresentar. Foi bom, pois tive oportunidade de revisar algo que tinha visto há tempos e não lembrava muito bem.



According to their reports, in almost every session they talked about their routine, lifestyle, jobs, characteristics of their cities, houses, interests, as illustrated in the selected excerpts (A:1, 2, 3). In excerpt A:3, we can highlight the learner's surprise in finding similarities with their partner. We can speculate that the Brazilian learner expected to find more differences, since they belonged to different countries. However, finding more similarities may have broken preconceived beliefs and expanded the learner's knowledge about the partner's reality. Most participants demonstrated that they built a close and personal relationship with their partners, allowing them to gain confidence and trust to share their personal information.

Students also talked about the COVID-19 pandemic. We noted that it was a common subject among the pairs, since their lives and routines were greatly impacted by the consequences of this global health and political crisis. Students reported talking about how things were going on during the pandemic, their government actions regarding this issue, and people's behaviors in the face of the rules of the quarantine in each country (excerpts B:1, 2, 3). Because the sessions were held during the first months of the pandemic, the number of cases and deaths due to the pandemic was increasing and there was no mention about vaccines, which was still an incipient discussion.

Regarding theme C, in which we highlighted direct mentions to how learners experienced the VE, we observed that most Brazilian participants were doing VE for the first time. When describing the experience of VE, most participants reported their feelings, which varied from nervousness in the beginning of the partnership to happiness (excerpts C:1, 2) and the contributions of the partnership to their improvement in English. In excerpt C:3, we observe that the participant highlighted the easiness of the partnerships, since they could talk about themes of interest to both of them. These characteristics highlighted by the participant can also be explained by what Vassallo and Telles (2009) describe as a peculiarity of tandem modalities: the pleasure of [sharing their experiences, meeting a new person, etc., insert where the pleasure comes from]. According to the authors, tandem practice has a big potential to encourage the pleasure in intercultural interaction. For them, as a form of interaction, "[...] it is not possible to do it without the participation and spontaneous, active and interactive engagement of the participants. In most interactions we can include humor, emotions, and pleasure in the exchange of experiences, as well as negative feelings of tension, competition, frustration, irritation and even anger⁹." (VASSALLO; TELLES, 2009, p. 33).

⁹ Original: "[...] não é possível realizá-lo sem a participação e envolvimento espontâneo, ativo e interativo dos parceiros. Na maioria das interações podemos incluir tanto o humor, as emoções e o prazer na troca de experiências, como também sentimentos negativos de tensão, competição, frustração, irritação e até raiva."



Another theme reported by the students was about the differences between Brazil and Mexico, theme D. This theme revealed the impact of the virtual exchange on students' attitudes to cultural differences, since they used to confront the distinctions between the two countries and also tried to make relations between them. Some students expressed that the subjects for the conversations came easily and naturally since they were ordinary topics for them (excerpts D:1, 2, 3). As we can see in their diaries, some students explored a variety of subjects, passing through what both countries had in common or was exclusive in one of the countries. Some more controversial topics were also developed by some groups, as we can see in D:3. However, it is worth emphasizing that these kinds of subjects demanded more world knowledge and linguistic skills by the students. Some pairs did not venture into more complex issues.

According to Thorne (2010), one of the goals of online intercultural exchanges is to develop learners' awareness of their own culture and the culture(s) of their partners. For Ten Thije (2003), the notion of culture is usually approached from a static perspective in intercultural communication, revealing an understanding of culture as a collection of "do" and "don't" that can be listed out of context, and based on a belief that the transference of culture, understood as information, can guarantee the success of intercultural communication. In these contexts, usually a learner expects that the "other" is going to be a representative of a whole national group, regardless of the social differences in a society, or, according to Liaw and Master (2010), learners in intercultural encounters are called to assume a responsibility as "cultural mediators", "border crossers" or "intercultural speakers". Although the idea of "success" is relative, we consider that this restricted approach to culture does not contribute to the development of a more critical and challenging learning process. We can observe that excerpts D:1 and D:2 align with Ten Thije discussion, since learners report a communicative process based on comparisons (fruits, food, Carnival, customs, festivals, what to do when visiting Mexico) and the establishment of differences. This process of establishment of differences has also been reported in analyses of interactions of Teletandem (TELLES, 2011, 2015).

A more complex analysis of the notion of culture can be discussed from the perspective of transculturality, which, according to Welsch (1999), considers that cultural identities are permeated by different global influences, constituting complex identities resulting from colonization, migration and globalization processes. This concept interacts with Piller's (2007) understanding that culture does not exist in isolation, but that it is a process of affiliation to different discourse communities. In this perspective, the author concludes that all communication is intrinsically intercultural.

Analysing excerpt D:3, we can observe how global influences permeate practices shared by learners, such as Christianity and the social movement Black Lives Matter¹⁰. The first, considering its

¹⁰ https://blacklivesmatter.com/about/



global colonization project was present in the learners' discourses, since both Brazil and Mexico are highly influenced by Christian values and practices. The second, a global social movement founded in the United States in 2013 in response to the acquittal of 17-year-old African-American Trayvon Martin's murderer, was emphasized by the Brazilian learner as an inevitable topic of discussion ("[...] In this fifth meeting, obviously, the subject was Black Lives Matter"). The explicit emphasis in "obviously" results from the structural racism in Brazilian society and in the United States, which victimized several Black children and young people, such as Agata, Miguel, Guilherme, mentioned by the participant. According to the excerpt, the learner explored more complex issues regarding racism in Brazil, dialoguing with the global movement Black Lives Matter, colonization, indigenous populations, linguistic diversity, and establishing comparisons with their partner's context ("[...] unlike the powerful Aztec Empire, in the region where [partner's name] lives [...]")¹¹.

Regarding theme E, in which students reported their learning strategies and resources used in the sessions, it was possible to see how they reconceptualized how they experienced the process of foreign language learning through the virtual exchange practice. It contributed to developing students' awareness of how interactional norms and communicative style can influence success in contexts of intercultural communication and collaboration and made it possible for them to use the language as a lingua franca, once they were primarily concerned with communicating successfully.

In the meantime, students resorted to strategies such as playing games and sharing school assignments to be done together. The use of online dictionaries was reported when they had problems regarding vocabulary (excerpt E:3). At this point, students also referred to the importance of motivation in learning and how technology can be used as an important tool in the teaching and learning of a language, as mentioned in E:1. Also, students had the opportunity to work collaboratively (excerpt E:2), helping each other regarding language issues, having the opportunity to give support and review contents learned.

Another important theme observed was the importance of the English language for the students. They used to comment on their performance during the interactions, their difficulties and easiness, and also what they could do to improve their linguistic skills. In talking, they realized they were all learning a second language, facing the same challenges and that they could improve together, by feeling free to learn and practice (excerpt E:1).

¹¹ One aspect of the excerpt D:3 that deserved a deeper analysis was the mention to Xuxa, referring to her as Pele's ex-girlfriend, followed by the laugh mark "rs", which in Portuguese is the abbreviation for "riso". Although the participant does not detail the reason for the laugh associate to this Brazilian singer and TV host we observe that this mention should be [Word choice here: deeply] approached in a mediation session, since it can be related to the learners' beliefs on different social, gender and racial norms and expectations regarding romantic relationships.



We realized how virtual exchange from the perspective of English as a lingua franca could contribute to the development of students' awareness of how interactional norms and communicative style can influence negotiation of meaning in contexts of intercultural communication and collaboration. We believe that the program achieved its goals of valuing English as a lingua franca since it prioritized its use among multilingual speakers in contextualized practices as a specific context of language use (DUBOC, 2019). Since both students in each pair were not native English speakers, but rather learners of English as a second language and were primarily using it for communication, they could draw on various resources in English, and in this sense, "in its emerging role as a world language, English has no native speakers" (RAJAGOPALAN, 2004, p. 112).

The students had the opportunity to feel that the language they were using was their property while they were using it, as stated by KirkPatrick (2006), once they could use the language actively, reflecting on the flexibility of the cultural norms of the users in this context. We realized the students felt confident in having contact with a non-native English-speaking pair since they both knew they were learning English and had much to offer to each other. This way, we consider this project was a first step to rethink the traditional scenario of teaching English in Brazil, since it was the first time these students had contact with other non-native speakers who were experiencing the same challenges they were, and could broaden their conceptions of the roles of English in their communicative processes.

Final remarks

In this article we presented an overview of the main characteristics of our first virtual exchange in ELF, discussing the challenges and perspectives for promoting future editions of the institutional partnership between UENP and UGMEX, and improving our mediation strategies, in order to help learners broaden their views on linguistic and cultural diversity within the scope of ELF. From our experience as mediators and teachers of English, we can highlight that this discussion aligns with a growing demand in Brazilian education systems to approach English from a decentered perspective from the dominant, colonizing and economic power of the English teaching industries centered on the norms of the standard American and British English.

As teachers who have experienced ourselves a linguistic education that mostly privileged communication through the lens of the construct of the "native speaker", which intrinsically advantadged representations of overly white, North-American and British, middle class, and heterosexual identities, we believe that, in order to fully explore the potential of virtual exchange practices, we need to tackle some of our own beliefs and the learners' perspectives on what the English language represents and on how we can decentralize it from the limited domain of an idealized "native speaker" spectrum, many times



portrayed by the private international corporations of English teaching as the one who can validate the learner's knowledge and capacity to communicate in English (ALVES, 2021). In this regard, from the perspective of ELF, this means to consider how learners make use of English to build and negotiate their social identities and representations of each other's cultures, as well as how they value linguistic variations in English.

Considering our perceived failure of the asynchronous tasks proposed, we consider this difficulty was caused by the novelty of this experience for us, but also by the circumstance of the pandemic, which changed the learners' conditions of participation throughout the process, as well as increased our workload and demands to adjust our classes and the virtual exchange to new platforms of interactions, like Google Classroom. In our practice, relying on online platforms before the pandemic served as a complementary context for the in-person classes and, suddenly, became an integral part of our routines.

For future editions of our virtual exchange institutional partnerships, we consider that the synchronous mediation sessions, as well as the asynchronous instruments of mediation, can be improved by the integration of discussions and readings on ELF, to raise learners' awareness on the processes of communication in their virtual exchange experiences. Considering the need to overcome the superficial approach to cultural differences observed in the learners' reports, we highlight the need for a critical discourse analysis of students' perspectives about their interactions (PENNYCOOK, 2001), in order to identify their beliefs and discourses on stereotypes, ethnic-racial, national, linguistic and other social inequalities within local and global societies.

Finally, regarding the discussion on the contributions of virtual exchange for the promotion of internationalization at home policies, the fact that, in our context, the intercultural partnership was promoted as an extra-curricular experience for a group of students from different areas who could do the interaction outside their undergraduate courses needs to be understood as only one of the forms that are possible within an institution. Integrating virtual exchange in ELF to the curriculum of undergraduate courses of different subject areas require adjustments to their curriculums and structures, considering, for example, how the partner institutions will negotiate and define the goals, conditions, and processes of the partnership. So, we believe that virtual exchange within the International Language Center of UENP benefit from its structure as an extra curricular program of the institution and from its flexibility to create and promote opportunities of telecollaboration that can reach students from the whole institution, however, it does not substitute a deeper discussion that needs to take place in order to guarantee that the benefits of such practices can also be integrated to all levels of the internationalization of the institution.



References

ALVES, L. C. 2021. Crencas sobre o falante nativo de língua inglesa no contexto teletandem.

Dissertação de Mestrado, Faculdade de Ciências e Letras, Universidade Estadual Paulista.

ANDRÉ, M. E. D. 1989. Estudo de caso: seu potencial na educação. Cadernos de Pesquisa, 49: 51-54.

BELLEN, J.; JONES, E. 2015. Redefining Internationalization at Home. In: CURAJ, A.; MATEI, L.; PRICOPIE, R.; SALMI, J.; SCOTT, P. (Eds.). The European Higher Education Area: Between Critical Reflections and Future Policies: 59 - 71. Springer.

DE WIT, H. 2016. Internationalisation and the role of Online Intercultural Exchange. In: O'DOWD, R.; LEWIS, T. (Orgs.). Online Intercultural Exchange: policy, pedagogy, practice. Routledge Studies in Language and Intercultural Communication.

CAVALARI, S. M. S. 2018. Integrating telecollaborative language learning into Higher Education: a study on teletandem practice. Brazilian English Language Teaching Journal, 9.2: 417-432.

COSTA, L. M. G.; SALOMÃO, A. C. B.; ZAKIR, M. A. 2018. Transcultural and Transcontinental Telecollaboration for Foreign Language Learning: Proposals and Challenges. Revista do GEL, 15.3: 26-41.

DOOLY, M.; O'DOWD, R. 2018. Chapter 1. Telecollaboration in the foreign language classroom: A review of its origins and its application to language teaching practice. In: DOOLY, M.; O'DOWD, R. (Eds.). In This Together: Teachers' Experiences with Transnational, Telecollaborative Language Learning Projects: 11 - 34. Peter Lang.

GARCIA, D. N. de M. 2020. Perspectivas educacionais e novas demandas: contribuições da telecolaboração. Cultura Acadêmica Editora.

GRADDOL, D. 2006. English Next. Why global English May Mean the End of 'English as a Foreign Language. The British Council.

HALL, S. 2006. A identidade cultural na pós-modernidade. DP&A. Tradução: Tomaz Tadeu da Silva, Guaracira Lopes Louro.

JENKINS, J. 2006. Global intelligibility and local diversity: Possibility or paradox. In: RUBDY, R.& SARACENI, M. (Eds.). English in the world: Global rules, global roles: 32-39. Continuum.

JENKINS, J. 2000. The phonology of English as an international language. Oxford University Press.

JENKINS, J. 2009. English as a lingua franca: interpretations and attitudes. World Englishes, 28.2: 200-207.

JENKINS, J; COGO, A.; DEWEY, M. 2011. State-of-the-art article: review of developments in research into English as a lingua franca. Language Teaching, 44.3: 281-315.

KE, I. C.; CAHYANI, H. 2014. Learning to become users of English as a lingua franca (ELF): How ELF online communication affects Taiwanese learners' beliefs of English. System, 46: 28–38.

KIRKPATRICK, A. 2006. Which model of English: Native-speaker, nativized or lingua franca? In: RUBDY, R.; SARACENI, M. (Orgs). *English in the world*: global rules, global roles: 71 - 83. Continuum. LIAW, M. L.; MASTER, S. L. 2010. Understanding telecollaboration through an analysis of intercultural discourse, Computer Assisted Language Learning, 23.1: 21-40.

O'DOWD, R. 2017. Virtual Exchange and internationalising the classroom. Training, language and culture. 1.4: 8-24.

O'DOWD, R. 2018. A transnational model of virtual exchange for global citizenship education. Revised version of a plenary address given at the Sixth International Conference on the Development and Assessment of Intercultural Competence: Intercultural Competence and Mobility: Virtual and Physical. January 25-28, University of Arizona, USA.

O'DOWD, R.; SAURO, S.; SPECTOR-COHEN, E. 2019. The Role of Pedagogical Mentoring in Virtual Exchange. *Tesol Quarterly*. 0.0: 1-27.

PAKIR, A. 2009. English as a lingua franca: analyzing research frameworks in international English, world Englishes, and ELF. World Englishes, 28.2: 224-235.



PENNYCOOK, A. 2001. Critical Applied Linguistics: A Critical Introduction. Routledge.

RABELLO, C. R. L. 2020. Intercâmbio virtual: contribuições para a aprendizagem da língua inglesa de estudantes de Letras. Revista Docência e Cibercultura, 4.3: 58-82.

RAJAGOPALAN, K. 2004. The concept of 'World English' and its implications for ELT. ELT Journal, 58.2: 111-117.

SALOMÃO, A. C. B. 2020. Intercâmbios virtuais e a internacionalização em casa: reflexões e implicações para a Linguística Aplicada. Revista Estudos Linguísticos, 49.1: 152-174.

SALOMÃO, A. C. B.; FREIRE JUNIOR, J. C. (Orgs.). 2020. Perspectivas de internacionalização em casa: intercâmbio virtual por meio do Programa BRaVE-Unesp. Cultura Acadêmica Editora.

SEIDLHOFER, B. 2001. Closing a conceptual gap: the case for a description of English as a lingua franca. International Journal of Applied Linguistics, 11.2: 133-158.

TELLES, J. A.; VASSALLO, M. L. 2006. Foreign language learning in-tandem: Teletandem as an alternative proposal in CALLT. The Especialist, 27.2: 189-212.

TELLES, J. A.; VASSALLO, J. A. 2009. Teletandem: uma proposta alternativa no ensino/aprendizagem assistidos por computadores. In: TELLES, J. A. (Org.). Teletandem: Um contexto virtual, autônomo e colaborativo para aprendizagem de línguas no século XXI: 43 - 61. Pontes Editores. TELLES, J. A. 2015. Teletandem and performativity. Revista Brasileira de Linguística Aplicada, 15: 1 -30.

TEN THIJE, J. D. 2003. The Transition from Misunderstanding to Understanding in Intercultural Communication. In: KOMLOSI, L. I.; HOUTLOSSER, P; LEZENBERG, M. (Eds.). Communication and Culture, Argumentative, Cognitive and Linguistic Perspectives: 197 – 213. Sic Sac.

THORNE, S. L. 2010. The 'Intercultural Turn' and Language Learning in the Crucible of New Media. In: HELM, F.; GUTH, S. (Eds.). Telecollaboration 2.0 for Language and Intercultural Learning: 139 – 164. Peter Lang.

THORNE, S. L. 2016. Forward: The virtual internationalization turn in language study. In: O'DOWD, R.; LEWIS, T. (Eds.). Online Intercultural Exchange: Policy, Pedagogy, Practice: ix-xi. Routledge. VASSALLO, M. L.; TELLES, J. A. 2009. Ensino e aprendizagem de línguas em tandem: princípios teóricos e perspectiva de pesquisa. In: TELLES, J. A. (Org.). Teletandem: Um contexto virtual, autônomo e colaborativo para aprendizagem de línguas no século XXI: 21 - 42. Pontes Editores. WELSCH, W. 1999. Transculturality: the puzzling form of cultures today. In: FEATHERSTONE, M.; LASH, S. Spaces of Culture: City, Nation, World: 194-213. Sage.

YIN, R. K. 2009. Case study research: design and methods. Sage.